

MINUTES

Erie County Council

View More At
www.eriecountypa.gov



Terry M. Scutella, Chairman
Chris Drexel, Vice Chairman
Charlie Bayle
Rock Copeland
André R. Horton
Ellen Schauerma
Jim Winarski

Erie County Courthouse
140 West 6th Street, Room 117
Erie, PA 16501

REGULAR MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, November 28, 2023

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The Pledge of Allegiance was led by Chairman Shank.

OPTIONAL PRAYER OR REFLECTION

Mrs. Schauerma recited an inspirational quote.

ROLL CALL

Members Present: Chairman Brian Shank, Vice Chairman Terry Scutella, Charlie Bayle, Andre Horton, Ellen Schauerma, Tom Spagel, and Jim Winarski

Others Present: Clerk Karen Chillcott, Deputy Clerk Megan Moore, Solicitor Tom Talarico, County Council Financial Advisors Kenny Bonus and Colin Domowicz, Administration Doug Smith and Paul Lichtenwalter

Please note that all discussions could not be documented, as Council members did not use their microphones throughout the meeting.

HEARING OF THE PUBLIC

Freda Tepfer

Freda Tepfer, Erie: Ms. Tepfer highlighted her attendance at the presentation hosted by the Jefferson Education Society, where the current deficit and proposed tax increase were discussed. She relayed her observations from the Finance and Personnel meetings and emphasized the frequent upgrades of positions within the County. She questioned the long-term impact of the position upgrades on the budget, including factors like benefits and retirement expenses. She raised concerns about the budgetary allocation to universities and the redirection of ARPA funds meant for COVID relief. She urged a reassessment of upgraded positions and recommended downsizing the Economic Development Department, emphasizing that economic development was not the primary function of the County. She suggested reconsidering the \$2 million grant for EMS from Gaming Revenue Funds, citing jurisdictions' preference for independent entities. She advocated for the restoration of grants to various organizations that she believed significantly contributed to the community. She emphasized the need to back out of the lease with Gannon and considered it a significant

mistake that required rectification. She conveyed a willingness to pay more taxes but emphasized the importance of sensible allocation.

Jerry Servidio

Mr. Servidio did not speak.

OTHER SPEAKERS:

Mary Rennie, Erie: Mrs. Rennie acknowledged that the Council had ample time to review the budget and did not expect to change minds. She recalled the previous year's acknowledgment that the budget was built on unstable foundations and emphasized the need for a budget process that, even if not fully resolved in the first year, took steps toward achieving a stable operational budget over the next few years. She noted that she had attended the event at the Jefferson Society, where she communicated with a Bonus Accounting Firm about the non-partisan nature of the budgeting process. While recognizing that budget discussions may have partisan elements, she emphasized that the fundamental process of budgeting should remain focused on dollars and cents, devoid of partisanship. She advocated for a budget process that prioritized the common good over individual preferences, defining good government as making decisions that would benefit everyone. She expressed her appreciation for the Council's dedication to the work and thanked them for their efforts.

Sean Held, Millcreek: Mr. Held reviewed parts of the budget, specifically highlighting page 354, which addressed Edmund L. Thomas' expenses. He noted that there were no allocated expenses for food at the Edmund L. Thomas Adolescent Center. He inquired about the treatment of individuals at the center. He expressed a concern about whether they would receive nutritious and humane food or would they continue to be served food that was similarly provided at the Erie County Prison. He emphasized the importance of ensuring that individuals, particularly children, received the quality of food they deserved.

Carl Anderson, Erie: Mr. Anderson expressed concerns about the County Council's apparent deviation from fiscal responsibility and independence. He criticized the Council's alignment with Brenton Davis, whom he accused of accomplishing little and undermining Erie County. He questioned the decision to destroy the Erie County farm and suggested retribution as the motive which would lead to economic consequences for West County. He raised the issue that County Council paid a former Deputy Clerk over \$83K for inappropriate hiring practices, doing so behind closed doors, violating the Sunshine Laws, never bringing it up to a public vote, and covering up the payments to hire a political hack who no longer even works for the Council. He further criticized the Council's treatment of the DEI Commission, the refusal to seat the rail commission, and the loss of millions in federal funds. He questioned the prioritization of funding for wealthy institutions over broader education programs. He highlighted escalating department costs and the lack of support for mandated programs like juvenile and adult probation and the prison. He mentioned concerns about long-term contracts at the library, suggesting an

attempt to undermine the entire library system. He urged the Council to be independent observers as they deliberated on the budget.

MINUTES FROM PREVIOUS MEETING

A motion to approve the October 31, 2023 meeting minutes was made by Mr. Scutella, seconded by Mr. Spagel, and the minutes were approved 7-0.

October 31, 2023 - Regular Meeting

REPORTS OF COUNTY OFFICIALS

**County Executive and/or
his Designee**

Finance Committee - Mrs. Schauerman Mrs. Schauerman reported that the Finance Committee met on November 16, and submitted to the agenda Old Business: A-T and New Business: C-J.

Personnel Committee - Mr. Scutella Mr. Scutella reported that the Personnel Committee met on November 16 and submitted to the agenda New Business: A and D

Other A motion to amend the agenda and vote on New Business prior to Old Business was made by Scutella, seconded by Spagel, and passed 7-0.

NEW BUSINESS

Ordinance Number 116, 2023 "Approval of the 2024 Erie County Non-Bargaining Employees Pay Plan" (Personnel Committee) Ms. Chillcott gave a First Reading of Ordinance Number 116, 2023 "Approval of the 2024 Erie County Non-Bargaining Employees Pay Plan".

Ordinance Number 117, 2023 "Approval of Amendment to the Agreement between the County of Erie and AFSCME Local 2666 (Professional) Increasing the Salaries Of Public Health Nurses" (Personnel Committee) Ms. Chillcott gave a First Reading of Ordinance Number 117, 2023 "Approval of Amendment to the Agreement between the County of Erie and AFSCME Local 2666 (Professional) Increasing the Salaries Of Public Health Nurses".

Resolution Number 38, 2023 "Approval of Tentative Lease Agreement with McKean Borough for Office Space Located at Main Street, McKean, Pennsylvania for Magisterial District Judge Denise Stuck-Lewis". Ms. Chillcott read Resolution Number 38, 2023 "Approval of Tentative Lease Agreement with McKean Borough for Office Space Located at 8952 North Main Street, McKean, Pennsylvania for Magisterial District Judge Denise Stuck-Lewis".

**8952 North Main Street,
McKean, Pennsylvania for
Magisterial District Judge
Denise Stuck-Lewis"
(Finance Committee)**

A motion was made by Schauerman, seconded by Winarski, and passed 7-0.

**Resolution Number 39,
2023 "Approval of
Tentative Lease Agreement
with Joseph N. Feghali for
Office Space Located at
1021 Parade Street, Erie,
Pennsylvania for
Magisterial District Judge
Edward Wilson"
(Personnel Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott read Resolution Number 39, 2023 "Approval of Tentative Lease Agreement with Joseph N. Feghali for Office Space Located at 1021 Parade Street, Erie, Pennsylvania for Magisterial District Judge Edward Wilson".

A motion was made by Schauerman, seconded by Bayle, and passed 7-0.

**Resolution Number 40,
2023 "Approving
Appointment of Kenny
Bonus, CPA and Bonus
Accounting LLC as
Financial Advisor for Erie
County Council" (Finance
Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott read Resolution Number 40, 2023 "Approving Appointment of Kenny Bonus, CPA and Bonus Accounting LLC as Financial Advisor for Erie County Council".

A motion was made by Schauerman, seconded by Spagel, and pass 6-0. (Bayle abstained)

**Resolution Number 41,
2023 "Approving the
Annual Budget of the Erie
Area Council of
Governments for the
Calendar Year Ending
December 31, 2024"
(Finance Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott read Resolution Number 41, 2023 "Approving the Annual Budget of the Erie Area Council of Governments for the Calendar Year Ending December 31, 2024".

A motion was made by Schauerman, seconded by Winarski, and passed 7-0.

**Resolution Number 42,
2023 "Approving the
Financial Statements and
Independent Auditor's
Report of the Erie Area
Council of Governments for
the Calendar Year Ending
December 31, 2022 and
2021" (Finance Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott read Resolution Number 42, 2023 "Approving the Financial Statements and Independent Auditor's Report of the Erie Area Council of Governments for the Calendar Year Ending December 31, 2022, and 2021".

A motion was made by Schauerman, seconded by Bayle, and passed 7-0.

**Resolution Number 43,
2023 "Erie County General
Authority Not to
Exceed\$4,500,000 Tax-
Exempt Revenue Note (The
Ball Pavilion Project)"
(Finance Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott read Resolution Number 43, 2023 "Erie County General Authority Not to Exceed \$4,500,000 Tax-Exempt Revenue Note (The Ball Pavilion Project).

A motion was made by Schauerman, seconded by Scutella, and passed 6-0. (Winarski abstained)

A motion to recess was made at 2:24pm by Scutella, seconded by Spagel and passed 7-0.

OLD BUSINESS

A motion to return from recess was made at 3:35pm by Scutella, seconded by Spagel, and passed 7-0.

Chairman Shank acknowledged the presence of some new individuals and emphasized the importance of proceeding through the budget process systematically. He expressed the intention to go through it step by step, line by line, and number by number to ensure everyone is on the same page. He noted that the staff had prepared a helpful guide for everyone.

**Ordinance Number 96,
2023 "Approving the 2024
Erie County Community
College Budget" (First
Read 10/31/23) (Finance
Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 96, 2023 "Approving the 2024 Erie County Community College Budget".

A motion was made by Schauerma, seconded by Winarski, and passed 7-0.

**Ordinance Number 97,
2023 "2024 Debt Service
Fund"
(First Read 10/31/23)
(Finance Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 97, 2023 "2024 Debt Service Fund".

A motion was made by Schauerma, seconded by Bayle, and passed 7-0.

**Ordinance Number 98,
2023 "2024 Employee
Fringe Benefit Fund
Budget" (First Read
10/31/23) (Finance
Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 98, 2023 "2024 Employee Fringe Benefit Fund Budget".

A motion was made by Schauerma, seconded by Winarski, and carried 7-0.

**Ordinance Number 99,
2023 "2024 Health Choices
Fund Budget"
(First Read 10/31/23)
(Finance Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 99, 2023 "2024 Health Choices Fund Budget".

A motion was made by Schauerman to amend the Ordinance to include action sheet 58.

Mr. Talarico proposed further clarification of the motion. He suggested that, given the nature of the Ordinance, it would be beneficial to specify the increase.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept the action sheet 58 to include the increases that were due to bargaining increases, seconded by Winarski and passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to approve Ordinance 99, 2023 as amended, seconded by Bayle, and passed 7-0.

**Ordinance Number 100,
2023 "2024 Mental
Health/Intellectual
Disabilities Fund Budget"
(First Read 10/31/23)
(Finance Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 100, 2023 "2024 Mental Health/Intellectual Disabilities Fund Budget".

Mr. Horton sought clarification on whether the numbers being discussed were the ones initially omitted and are now being added.

Mr. Bonus confirmed that the figures in question were related to union contracts that were finalized after the budget was published.

Mr. Horton inquired about the final number for the township, to which Mr. Bonus provided information, stating that the bargaining increase amounted to \$1,276,990.65, impacting the budget. Mr. Horton noted that this addition increased the total to roughly \$13 million.

Mr. Horton emphasized that, by law, they were supposed to receive a balanced budget from the Administration by October 1st. He expressed disappointment that what they received was almost a budget, and he was unsure about the implications under the Home Rule Charter.

A motion was made by Scutella to accept action sheet 61, seconded by Winarski, and passed with a 7-0 vote.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept the amended ordinance, seconded by Winarski, and passed 7-0.

Mr. Smith raised a concern about the order of the sheets and whether it needed to be addressed by a vote, as it had been done historically. He emphasized the importance of aligning the face sheets with the appropriate numbers after the

amendments.

Ms. Moore sought clarification on the new number with the increase, to which Mr. Bonus provided the revised figure of \$36,573,324.49.

Regarding item D, Ms. Moore stated that Ordinance 99 was \$151,345,101, the original amount, and an amended amount was needed for the face sheet.

Mr. Bonus clarified that the adjusted number would be \$151,349,975.93 for amended Ordinance 99.

**Ordinance Number 101,
2023 "2024 Drug and
Alcohol Abuse Fund
Budget"
(First Read 10/31/23)
(Finance Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 101, 2023 "2024 Drug and Alcohol Abuse Fund Budget".

A motion was made by Schauerma, seconded by Spagel, and carried 7-0.

A motion was made by Scutella to accept action sheet 33, reflecting an increase of \$4,857.22, seconded by Spagel and passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerma to accept Ordinance 101 as amended, including the increase due to bargaining wages of \$4857.22. This was seconded by Bayle and passed 7-0.

Ms. Moore inquired about the new number, and Mr. Bonus confirmed that it is now reflecting \$8,104,967.22.

**Ordinance Number 102,
2023 "2024 Children and
Youth Services Fund
Budget" (First Read
10/31/23) (Finance
Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott presented the Second Reading of Ordinance Number 102, 2023, titled "2024 Children and Youth Services Fund Budget".

A motion was put forward by Mrs. Schauerma and seconded by Mr. Bayle.

A motion was made by Scutella to amend all action sheets collectively, advocating for a single vote, seconded by Spagel and failed 0-7.

Chairman Shank sought clarification on the action sheets in question, specifying them as No. 25, 26, 27, and 62 through 69, to which Mr. Bonus confirmed.

Mrs. Schauerma emphasized the necessity to address certain items separately, underscoring that they could not all be tackled collectively.

Mr. Spagel sought clarification on the motion, specifically asking about the action sheets to be voted on as one.

Mr. Talarico suggested clarifying whether the intention was to group all action sheets together.

Mr. Scutella specifically identified action sheets 25, 26, 27, and 62 through 69. Referring to Ellen's preference, Mr. Talarico proposed breaking down the action sheets.

Mrs. Schauerma confirmed that action sheet 25 should be separated.

Mr. Talarico reiterated the decision to address action sheet 25 separately and suggested Mr. Scutella either move to amend or vote on the remaining balance of the sheets.

Mr. Spagel sought clarification on information regarding action sheet 25 line

items, to which Mr. Horton and Mr. Bayle provided statements on each line.

A motion was made by Scutella for action sheet 25, suggesting a decrease of \$4,982,923, second from Schauerma and failed 0-7.

A motion was made by Horton to amend action sheet 25 and then address each line item individually, seconded by Schauerma and passed 7-0.

Mr. Talarico explained that there would be one motion to decrease overtime pay as it is action sheet 25a, if they are going through each fund individually.

A motion was made by Horton to decrease overtime in Fund No. 42 [2024 Children and Youth Services Fund Budget] action sheet 25a, seconded by Winarski. Which no vote was called.

Mrs. Schauerma expressed concerns about the entire page, emphasizing that it should not be altered. She highlighted the necessity of overtime in the OCY department due to unfilled positions, legal requirements, workload completion, and report generation.

Mr. Shank sought clarification, questioning whether the vote was for a decrease in overtime, and Mrs. Schauerma affirmed.

Mr. Horton again proposed a motion to Amend Action Sheet 25a, changing the figure from \$105,000 to \$50,000, was seconded by Mr. Scutella and passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Scutella to accept Action Sheet 25a As Amended, decreasing the overtime to \$50,000, seconded by Horton, and passed 4-3 (Bayle, Schauerma, Shank).

Mr. Lichtenwalter expressed concern about the potential consequences of reducing the general fund transfer. He reminded everyone that he had previously mentioned a projected \$710,000 decrease in the general fund transfer if all proposed cuts were implemented from the \$13 million budget. He highlighted that Patrick Ryan at OCY did not conduct calculations for various scenarios and provided an example where a \$105,000 reduction in overtime only resulted in a \$25,709.40 decrease in the general fund transfer. He emphasized the need for recalculations to determine the updated figures.

Mr. Horton asked for a point of order to the Chair, noting that the matter had moved beyond Mr. Lichtenwalter's comments. He emphasized that the Administration had the budget and since October 1st, providing ample time for questions and clarifications. He stressed the importance of focusing on the budget during the meeting, discouraging commentary from the Administration during this meeting.

A motion was made by Spagel for action sheet 25b, advertising with the decrease of \$2,000, seconded by Winarski.

Mrs. Schauerma asked for clarification on the original budget amount. Mr.

Bonus responded that the original proposed 2024 budget amount was \$10,000. Roll call vote for action sheet 25b passed 6-1 (Schauerman).

A motion was made by Scutella for action sheet 25c, seconded by Horton. Mr. Spagel asked for the specific dollar amount. Mr. Bonus provided the amount presented in the budget for the record. Roll call vote on action sheet 25c passed 5-2 (Bayle, Schauerman).

A motion was made by Spagel for action sheet 25d, adoption subsidies, seconded by Horton. Mr. Scutella asked for the specific dollar amount from the proposed budget. Mr. Bonus provided the amount presented in the original budget. Mrs. Schauerman noted her belief that they will be back to ask for the money next year. Mr. Spagel and Mr. Horton provided input on action sheet 25d and the original budget. Roll call vote on action sheet 25d passed 5-2 (Bayle, Schauerman).

A motion was made by Schauerman for action sheet 25e, seconded by Bayle. Mrs. Schauerman asked Mr. Bonus for the dollar amount as presented in the 2024 budget. Mr. Bonus stated the amount was \$25,000 in the original 2024 budget. Mr. Spagel and Mr. Horton both provided input on action sheet 25e and the original budget. Roll call vote for action sheet 25e passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman for action sheet 25f, program supplies, seconded by Bayle. Mrs. Schauerman asked for the original amount in the budget and a discussion on the budget breakdown for action sheet 25f. Mr. Horton provided feedback. Roll call vote for action sheet 25f passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Scutella for action sheet 25g, seconded by Winarski. Mrs. Schauerman sought the budget amount as presented. Mr. Bonus provided the dollar amount from page 340 of the 2023 proposed budget as \$1,050,000. Mr. Bayle provided his opinion that this amount is for placements and that they can't touch this money. Mr. Horton also contributed to the discussion, as well as Mr. Spagel. Roll call vote for action sheet 25g passed 5-2 (Bayle, Schauerman).

A motion was made by Schauerman for action sheet 25h, Perseus House, \$800,000 decrease, seconded by Scutella. Mr. Bonus stated for the record on page 341 of the proposed 2023 budget is \$3,100,000. Mr. Spagel and Mr. Horton both participated in the discussion. Roll call vote for action sheet 25h passed 5-2 (Bayle, Schauerman).

A motion was made by Schauerman for action sheet 25i, \$400,000 decrease for Outside Inside School, seconded by Winarski.

Mr. Bonus provided the amount in the proposed budget page 341, \$800,000. Mr. Horton noted that this a 100% increase since last year.
Roll call vote for action sheet 25i passed 5-2 (Bayle, Schauerman).

A motion was made by Winarski for action sheet 25j, other purchased services decrease amount \$100,000, seconded by Scutella.
Mr. Horton contributed to the discussion. Roll call vote for action sheet 25j passed 5-2 (Bayle, Schauerman)

A motion was made by Schauerman for action sheet 25k, Children's Home of Pittsburgh, decrease amount \$40,000, seconded by Scutella.
Mr. Bonus noted the information of the proposed budget page 341, \$80,000 as the proposed amount.
Roll call vote for action sheet 25k passed 5-2 (Bayle, Schauerman).

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 25l, Summit Academy, decrease amount \$600,000, seconded by Scutella, passed 5-2 (Bayle, Schauerman).

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 25m, Devereux Georgia, decrease amount \$100,000, seconded by Bayle.
Mrs. Schauerman asked that Mr. Bonus please just read every line item for Action sheet 25 as they go through each. Mr. Bonus affirmed that page 342 of the proposed 2023 budget has a figure of \$200,000 and the previous 2023 budget adjusted was \$100,000. Mrs. Schauerman noted that it appeared that \$176,000 was spent in 2022 and wanted it to be known.
Roll call vote for action sheet 25m passed 5-2 (Bayle, Schauerman).

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 25n, Children's Choice Inc., decrease amount \$20,000, seconded by Bayle.
Mr. Bonus noted page 342 \$50,000 and adjusted 2023 budget reflected \$30,000.
Roll call vote for action sheet 25n failed 0-7.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 25o, Cumberland Hospital for Children, decrease amount \$340,000, seconded by Bayle.
Mr. Bonus noted that on page 342 of the proposed budget for 2024, its \$500,000, and the adjusted budget for 2023 was \$160,000. Mr. Horton contributed to the discussion. No vote on the motion brought by Mrs. Schauerman as it was discussed that an amendment should be motioned for action sheet 25o.

A motion was made by Horton to amend action sheet 25o to change the amount to \$200,000, seconded by Winarski.
Mrs. Schauerman asked for clarification on the figures and the correct math, and it was clarified that the amount to be adjusted in the budget for 2024 would be \$300,000.
Mr. Talarico noted the details of a needed vote for amendment acceptance.
Roll call vote to amend action sheet 25o to the amount \$200,000, passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Spagel to accept the amended action sheet 25o with an amended amount of \$200,000, seconded by Horton.

Mrs. Schauerman asked for clarification on the need for another vote, and Mr. Shank provided clarification.

Roll call vote on action sheet 25o as amended passed 5-2 (Bayle, Schauerman).

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 26, seconded by Scutella.

Mr. Bonus noted on page 349 of the 2024 proposed budget, the amount to be \$40,000, and the adjusted budget 2023 amount reflects \$43,000. Mr. Spagel participated in the discussion prior to the roll call vote, however is indiscernible. Mrs. Schauerman noted the decrease amount is \$15,000.

Roll call vote for action sheet 26, failed 3-4 (Horton, Shank, Winarski).

Mr. Shank asked the council whether action sheets 27, 62 through 69 should be separated or lumped together as one vote. Mrs. Schauerman noted they could be lumped together but someone should bring a motion to vote.

A motion was made by Scutella to accept action sheets 27, 62 through 69 as one vote, and seconded by Horton.

Mrs. Schauerman asked for a pause to read through the action sheets. She then asked Mr. Bonus for the amounts of Program Supplies from 2023. He noted page 351 of the 2024 budget has \$250,000, and the adjusted 2023 budget was \$70,000. Mr. Horton discussed the difference between the years, as did Mrs. Schauerman and Mr. Spagel. Mr. Shank agreed that action sheets should be voted on separately.

Mr. Scutella's motion to amend all action sheets together was disregarded after discussion on action sheet 27, and Mr. Talarico suggested a new motion be made.

A motion was made by Spagel to amend action sheet 27 with a new decrease of \$70,000, seconded by Horton, and passed 5-2 (Schauerman, Bayle).

A motion was made by Horton to accept action sheet 27 as amended, seconded by Scutella, passed 5-2 (Bayle, Schauerman).

Mr. Talarico noted that the motion brought to separate the action sheets 27, 62-69 did not move as a vote was not taken. Mr. Shank affirmed that only action sheet 27 was addressed, amended, and a vote was passed.

Mrs. Schauerman asked if the amounts needed to be read. Mr. Talarico stated amounts may change. Mrs. Schauerman corrected Mr. Talarico stating these are bargaining wages. Ms. Moore noted that the face sheet of the ordinance amount will change as it will need to be amended with the previous amounts being adjusted.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheets 62-69, seconded by Bayle, passed 7-0.

Chairman Shank begins discussing Ordinance 103. Ms. Moore emphasized that there needs to be first a motion and a vote for ordinance 102 before moving to the next agenda item.

A motion was made by Horton to accept Ordinance 102 as amended, seconded by Spagel.

Mr. Horton asks for the amended number for Ordinance 102. Ms. Moore concurred with the need for the new total, Mr. Bonus stated the original amount being \$81,701,902 and the new figure is \$76,980,086.67 and the difference is \$4,721,815.33.

Roll call vote to accept ordinance 102 as amended passed 7-0.

Mr. Scutella Motion to recess, seconded by Spagel passed 7-0 at 4:49pm

**Ordinance Number 103,
2023 "2024 Planning and
Community Development
Fund Budget" (First Read
10/31/23) (Finance
Committee)**

Return from recess at 5:04pm

Council discussed whether the action sheets 28 and 30 are duplicated. Mr. Bonus affirmed that pages 518 and 442 of the budget were his source, but the action sheets showed the same fund.

Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 103, 2023 "2024 Planning and Community Development Fund Budget".

Mrs. Schauerman motions Ordinance 103, 2023, seconded by Mr. Winarski.

A motion was made by Scutella to separate the action sheets seconded by Schauerman, passed 7-0.

Mr. Shank clarified the first action sheet is 28.

A motion was made by Schauerman to approve action sheet 28, seconded by Bayle.

Mrs. Schauerman sought clarification from Mr. Bonus regarding the funding source and amount. Mr. Bonus clarified that the \$800,000 is a reduction from the Gaming Fund Revenue and corresponding pass thru grant.

Mr. Horton contributed to the discussion concerning the Gaming Fund, and highlighted its support for the Community College. He emphasized his opposition to Gaming Fund revenue use for other purposes and stressed the need to preserve its balance. Mr. Spagel attempted to contribute to the discussion but was inaudible. Mr. Bonus emphasized the importance to preserve the Gaming Fund, even if other departments required funding. Mr. Horton reiterated his stance against using Gaming Funds for EMS, and emphasized the need for state intervention with EMS issues and cautioned against burdening taxpayers with additional costs. Mrs. Schauerman inquired about the timing of Gaming Fund, to which Mr. Bonus stated he lacked specific information but emphasized the need to protect the fund. Mr. Horton expressed

concern over the sustainability of using Gaming Funds for ongoing expenses. Mr. Shank shared his experiences of fundraising for fire department needs, and highlighted the challenges smaller departments faced. Mr. Horton reiterated opposition from his district, Lawrence Park, and emphasized that EMS issues should be addressed as a state problem, not a local funding obligation. He clarified that EMS concerns were separate from policing matters.

Mr. Shank asked for a roll call vote for action sheet 28.

Roll call vote for action sheet 28, failed 2-5 (Horton, Scutella)

A motion was made by Scutella for action sheet 29, a decrease of \$22,500 for advertising and seconded by Spagel.

Mrs. Schauerma asks if the amount will be \$0 and Mr. Bonus stated that it would leave \$2,500 for advertising after the decrease of \$22,500. Mr. Horton contributed to the discussion with historical information about the budget for this particular item and Mr. Shank affirms the reason for the decrease this year.

Roll call vote for action sheet 29, passed 6-1 (Schauerma)

Mr. Bonus remarked that action sheet 30 is redundant. Mr. Horton asks if the action sheet can be removed and move on.

A motion was made by Schauerma to accept action sheet 70, increase due to bargaining wages, \$22,674.54, seconded by Spagel.

Mrs. Schauerma noted this amount and the increase are in fact due to the bargaining wages.

Roll call vote for action sheet 70, passed 7-0

A motion was made by Schauerma to accept ordinance 103 as amended, second by Mr. Spagel, and passed 7-0

Mr. Bonus stated \$13,478,491.54 as the amended amount for the face sheet on Ordinance 103.

**Ordinance Number 104,
2023 "2024 Domestic
Relations Fund Budget"
(First Read 10/31/23)
(Finance Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott gave a second reading of Ordinance Number 104, 2023 "2024 Domestic Relations Fund Budget".

Mr. Shank noted there is no action sheet, Mr. Bonus affirmed there is no action sheet.

A motion was made by Schauerma to approve Ordinance Number 104, seconded by Bayle and passed 7-0.

**Ordinance Number 105,
2023 "2024 Library Fund
Budget"
(First Read 10/31/23)
(Finance Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 105, 2023 "2024 Library Fund Budget".

Mr. Shank noted action sheets 31 and 60 to be reviewed.

A motion was made by Schauerma, seconded by Bayle. No vote was called

on the proposed motion.

A motion was made by Scutella to amend and separate the action sheets, seconded by Schauerman and passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 31 with a decrease in travel, and seconded by Bayle, passed 7-0.

A motion was made by. Schauerman to accept action sheet 60, an increase in wages due to bargaining, \$193,237.92, seconded by Bayle, passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept Ordinance 105 as amended and seconded by Bayle, passed 7-0.

Mr. Bonus noted the amended amount is now \$8, 610621.92.

**Ordinance Number 106,
2023 "2024 Public Health
Fund Budget"
(First Read 10/31/23)
(Finance Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 106, 2023 "2024 Public Health Fund Budget".

Mr. Shank noted only action 59 pertains to this ordinance.

A motion was made by Scutella to amend ordinance number 106 and to approve action sheet 59 with an increase to \$128,390.28 due to bargaining wages, seconded by Schauerman, passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept Ordinance Number 106 as amended, seconded by Bayle, passed 7-0.

Mr. Bonus noted that the amount was now amended to reflect \$12,102,857, compared to the original amount of \$11,974,467, with the increase on action sheet 59 attributed to bargaining wages.

**Ordinance Number 107,
2023 "2024 Public Safety
Fund Budget"
(First Read 10/31/23)
(Finance Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 107, 2023 "2024 Public Safety Fund Budget".

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept Ordinance Number 107, seconded by Mr. Bayle.

A motion was made by Scutella to amended Ordinance Number 107, 2023 to accept action sheet 71 with an increase due to bargaining wages, seconded by Schauerman, passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept Ordinance Number 107 as amended with the new amount, seconded by. Bayle, passed 7-0.

Mr. Bonus stated that the amended amount on the included action sheet was now \$10,110,914.

**Ordinance Number 108,
2023 "2024 Gaming Fund
Budget"
(First Read 10/31/23)
(Finance Committee)**

Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 108, 2023 "2024 Gaming Fund Budget".

Mr. Shank noted the corresponding action sheet 32.

A motion was made by Schauerma to accept Ordinance Number 108, seconded by Bayle.

A motion was made by Scutella to accept the action sheet 32 decrease, seconded by Schauerma.

Mr. Horton asked for clarification on the amendment. Mr. Shank noted it is to accept the action sheet.

Mr. Horton contributed to the need for the corrected sheets to reflect the amount. Mr. Bonus affirmed the amount to be amended and moved as it was a duplicate from Planning.

A motion was made by Horton to amend action sheet 32 that reflected a duplicate line item, and to only have the amount of \$2,000,000, seconded by Bayle, passed 7-0 .

A motion was made by Scutella to accept action sheet 32 as amended, seconded by Horton.

Mr. Bayle highlighted overwhelming support for the EMS program and proposed reallocating assets to ensure county-wide service coverage. Mrs. Schauerma echoed this sentiment, emphasizing the urgency of swift action in her district. Mrs. Schauerma requested input from the Administration, which prompted Mr. Lichtenwalter to express concerns about funding from the General Fund. Mr. Smith emphasized the collaborative effort between the City and County to provide comprehensive coverage. Mr. Bonus raised questions regarding the sustainability of funding, suggesting that if ongoing, it should be sourced from the General Fund rather than the Gaming Fund, with taxes supporting the program.

A motion was made by Schauerma to amend the action sheet 32 to reflect a change to the source of funding, from Gaming Fund to the General Fund, seconded by Bayle.

Mr. Scutella expressed opposition to funding an EMS Program. Mr. Horton referenced the Home Rule Charter and suggested that funding such programs through taxes was not feasible due to their statewide nature. He cautioned against using Gaming Revenue for new programs or hires, emphasizing the need for thorough discussion before allocating \$2,000,000 to the program. Mr. Talarico recommended a needs assessment and understanding legal requirements before approving funds for a county-wide EMS program. He suggested imposing restrictions on fund usage and requiring council approval for expenditures.

Mr. Shank requested Mrs. Schauerma to clarify her proposed motion, which aimed to change the funding source from Gaming to the General Fund.

Mr. Horton responded to Mr. Talarico's concerns, highlighting the lack of comprehensive information on the program's scope. Mrs. Schauerma noted

public discussions on the matter, though Mr. Horton contested that public meetings differ from formal public hearings. Mr. Spagel attempted to contribute to the discussion but was inaudible. Mr. Bayle mentioned an ongoing meeting at the Blasco Library regarding the EMS program. Mr. Horton attempted further contribution on the subject but was not clearly audible.

Mr. Shank sought clarification on the council's specific action. Mrs. Schauerma reiterate the motion to change the funding source of the EMS fund to the General Fund.

Roll call vote passed 6-1 (Scutella).

Mr. Horton acknowledged a change in funding source but questioned the ongoing request amount. Mrs. Schauerma confirmed the continued request, while Mr. Talarico suggested imposing restrictions until a plan was presented. Mr. Smith raised the question of whether a plan should precede the funding request this year. Mrs. Schauerma sought clarification from Mr. Talarico regarding the wording of the restriction if funding was approved. Mr. Talarico proposed the phrase "Restricted pending future Council action." Mrs. Schauerma understood that meant Council would allocate funds before finalizing the plan. Mr. Talarico stressed the need for the Administration to present a plan for Council approval before proceeding. Mr. Scutella reiterated his opposition to the EMS Program. Mr. Horton cautioned against raising taxes without a concrete plan in place, emphasizing the importance of following proper procedures. Mr. Winarski also expressed opposition to approving funding for the program at this time. Mr. Horton queried the pending vote before the Council. Ms. Moore clarified that the vote regarding the General Fund was not imminent. Mr. Horton stated he would like to vote on this General Fund item now and cut the 2 million EMS funding.

A motion was made by Horton to decrease \$2,000,000 from the General Fund, seconded by Scutella, passed 4-3 (Bayle, Schauerma, and Shank).

A motion was made by Schauerma to accept ordinance 108, 2023 as amended, seconded by Mr., Bayle, passed 6-0 (Horton, Absent)

Mr. Shank called for recess at 6:02pm

**Ordinance Number 109,
2023 "2024 Liquid Fuels
Fund Budget"
(First Read 10/31/23)
(Finance Committee)**

Returned from recess at 6:11pm

Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 109, 2023 "2024 Liquid Fuels Fund Budget".

Mr. Shank noted no action sheets for the next 5 items on the agenda [N-R].

A motion was made by Schauerma to accept Ordinance 109, 2023, seconded by Bayle, passed 7-0

**Ordinance Number 110,
2023 "2024 Pleasant Ridge
Manor Operating Fund**

Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 110, 2023 "2024 Pleasant Ridge Manor Operating Fund Budget".

Budget" (First Read 10/31/23) (Finance Committee)	A motion was made by Schauerman to approve Ordinance 110, 2023 seconded by Mr. Bayle, passed 7-0.
Ordinance Number 111, 2023 "2024 Pleasant Ridge Manor Depreciation Reserve Fund Budget" (First Read 10/31/23) (Finance Committee)	Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 111, 2023 "2024 Pleasant Ridge Manor Depreciation Reserve Fund Budget". A motion was made by Schauerman to accept Ordinance 111, 2023 seconded by Winarski, passed 7-0.
Ordinance Number 112, 2023 "2024 Erie County Care Management Budget" (First Read 10/31/23) (Finance Committee)	Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 112, 2023 "2024 Erie County Care Management Budget". A motion was made by Schauerman to accept Ordinance 112, 2023, seconded by Bayle, passed 7-0.
Ordinance Number 113, 2023 "2024 American Rescue Plan Act Fund Budget" (First Read 10/31/23) (Finance Committee)	Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 113, 2023 "2024 American Rescue Plan Act Fund Budget". A motion was made by Schauerman to accept Ordinance 113, seconded by Bayle, passed 7-0.
Ordinance Number 114, 2023 "2024 General Fund Budget" (First Read 10/31/23) (Finance Committee)	Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 114, 2023 "2024 General Fund Budget". Mr. Shank noted there are several action sheets attached to this item. Mrs. Schauerman motions Ordinance 114, 2023, seconded by Mr. Bayle. A motion was made by Scutella, a motion to accept action sheets 1-24; 34-57; 72 & 73. Mr. Lichtenwalter interrupted to address the council regarding the allocation of ARPA funds and the previous agenda item Ordinance Number 113, 2023. A motion was made by Scutella to fund outside counsel through ARPA funds and noted Mr. Bonus's intention to create action sheet 74 to amend Ordinance 113, 2023, and was seconded by Winarski. Mr. Scutella stressed that using ARPA funds to support outside counsel, who represented citizens in court, aligned with ARPA funding criteria. Mr. Scutella referenced media reports that indicated the potential for lawsuits due to inadequate representation and would lead to the wrongful incarceration of citizens. Mr. Horton contributed to the discussion and expressed concerns about the proposal's financial implications and the selection criteria for outside counsel. He highlighted the financial strain on taxpayers, emphasized the state's responsibility in funding such initiatives, and questioned the necessity of

allocating ARPA funds for this purpose.

Mr. Scutella sought clarification on the clientele of the proposed outside counsel, specifying representation for children and disadvantaged demographics.

Mr. Horton reiterated his stance and emphasized that state budget allocations should cover such needs rather than relying on city funds. Through discussion it was clarified that the proposed outside counsel positions would be part-time with their own malpractice insurance. Mr. Lichtenwalter interjected and highlighted the inevitability of expenditure. Mr. Horton reminded the Council of existing state budget allocations for similar issues. Mr. Scutella defended the proposal's one-year time frame, expressed confidence in the matter being resolved, and echoed sentiments from President Judge Walsh. Mr. Horton reiterated that ARPA funds were intended for pandemic-affected communities and expressed disapproval of diverting funds from disadvantaged groups for legal representation.

Mr. Spagel inquired about previous expenditures on outside counsel, and Mr. Lichtenwalter confirmed \$989,400 was spent last year. Mr. Spagel questioned the rationale behind a significant increase this year. Mr. Talarico acknowledged the urgency of the issue and the County's obligation to provide legal defense, particularly for indigent individuals. He highlighted challenges in attracting young lawyers to such positions and suggested adjusting compensation and benefits to attract candidates.

The HR department clarified legal requirements for benefit provision and the impossibility of reducing the number of proposed positions. The proposal aimed to parallel part-time public defender roles, ensuring no conflict of interest. The court administrator (Bob Catalde) emphasized the urgent need for additional legal support, similar to the challenges faced by public defenders. Mr. Horton asked if the state was working on something to solve the problem and it was intended that the ARPA funds were to only help for one year. Mr. Horton noted he did not have enough information to fully support the proposal and expressed his concerns should the state not step in after one year. Mr. Scutella noted he was thinking outside the box to solve an issue the Courts were facing on funding positions. Mr. Bonus addressed the Council regarding the OCY Department covering \$290,000 of the outside solicitors; and should the ARPA use be reduced.

Mr. Lichtenwalter interjected.

Mr. Horton emphasized that Mr. Lichtenwalter be clear and polite. Mr. Horton noted that there was a Court proceeding on funds and it was difficult to fully address the matter. Additionally OCY funds would only represent children who were dependents within the OCY Department.

Mr. Horton stated it was not just children who needed the representation and made a suggestion for money with Human Services; there were just too many unanswered questions. He expressed fear that unanswered questions would result in large bills. Mr. Bonus noted with the OCY Fund contributing to the outside counsel that \$1,600,119 would be needed of ARPA Funds.

Roll call vote to create and accept action sheet 74 with amount of \$1,600,119, passed 6-1 (Horton).

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept Ordinance 113, 2023, as

amended, with the new amount being \$7,162,617, was seconded by Scutella, and passed 6-1 (Horton).

Chairman Shank noted that the next actions sheets would address Ordinance 114, 2023.

Mrs. Schauerman asked what sheets were bargaining wages. Mr. Bonus noted that Action Sheets 34-57 were bargaining wages.

A motion was made by Schauerman to do Action Sheets 34-57 together, seconded by Winarski and passed 7-0.

Mr. Bonus stated the bargaining wages were \$756,677.76 in total.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 1, a decrease for County Council travel to \$15,000, and was seconded by Scutella.

Mr. Bonus stated it was a decrease of \$7,900.

Mr. Horton emphasized that the travel amount should not be decreased with new members entering Council, and with places opened back up they would need the money to travel. Mr. Shank stated his position that there should be a decrease and if more money was needed, they could come back and ask at that time.

Roll call vote for action sheet 1 passed 6-1 (Horton).

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 2 to decrease travel work by \$3,000 for Conduct of Elections, seconded by Bayle, and passed 6-1 (Horton).

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 3, seconded Spagel.

Mrs. Schauerman stated this was for a position that was already filled for an employee at the HRC.

Roll call vote for action sheet 3 passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 4, seconded by Scutella, passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 5, reduce travel expenses in the County Executive's office, seconded by Scutella and passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 6, a reduction for the Economic Development office and seconded by Scutella.

Mr. Horton motioned to dissolve the entire department. Mrs. Schauerman clarified that action sheet 7 would reflect what Mr. Horton suggested.

Mr. Shank suggested everyone wait and first vote on the motion brought forward on action sheet 6 and asked for discussion on action sheet 6.

Mrs. Schauerman wondered if action sheet 7 should be done first. She asked if it mattered if they voted on the sheets out of order.

Mr. Talarico stated it did not matter.

A motion was made by Schauerma to do action sheet 7 first and was seconded by Bayle.

Mr. Horton asked that the Council eliminate the department. He believed the County's focus should be on human services. He noted the economic development took resources and a large portion was on wages and salaries and offered that the department be reduced, as there was no return. Mr.

Bayle stated he has seen a return and the benefits the County residents received, and he did not support the removal of the department.

Mrs. Schauerma stated she agreed with Mr. Bayle and that there were people who were grateful for the Economic Development department. Mr. Horton disagreed. Mr. Bayle mentioned the GIS department and other benefits with waste water and how the department had helped the County, and if the tax base was not increased infrastructure could not be updated; and economic development brought business and built the tax base. Mr. Horton noted that the storm water grant existed prior to the Economic Development Department and it was a duplication of effort because the Planning Department was already doing what the Economic Development was doing, and then to create a GIS department: this was not a good use of tax payer's dollars.

Roll call vote to remove the Economic Development, as reflected on action sheet 7 failed 2-5 (Horton, Scutella).

A motion was made by Schauerma to separate action sheet 6, the two lines, and vote on just travel, now action sheet 6a, seconded by Scutella, passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerma to accept action sheet 6b second line from action sheet 6, a decrease of \$25,000 and seconded by Scutella.

Mr. Bonus noted that last year it was \$100,000, and as of August 2023, there was roughly \$4000.

Roll call vote for the new action sheet 6b, passed 5-2 (Bayle, Schauerma)

Mr. Horton asked to create a new action sheet for temporary staff.

Mrs. Schauerma clarified that action sheet 8 addressed the line item for temporary staff.

Mr. Horton apologized for the confusion on his part.

A motion was made by Schauerma to accept action sheet 8 to decrease \$26750 temporary staff in the Economic Development Department, seconded by Scutella and passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerma to accept action sheet 9, to decrease travel by \$1,000 and advertising by \$5,000 for Human Resources, seconded by Bayle and passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerma to accept action sheet 10 to decrease

constable fees by \$25,000 for the Director of Finance, seconded by Spagel.
Mrs. Schauerman asked Mr. Bonus to provide the proposed budget amount.
Mr. Bonus stated that on budget page 45, constable fees were \$150,000.
Mrs. Schauerman asked for reason it increased.
Mr. Horton provided historical amounts.
Mr. Spagel contributed to the discussion but was indiscernible.
Roll call vote for action sheet 10, passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 11 to decrease the restricted account by \$149,990 for General Accounting, seconded by Winarski and passed 7-0.

Mrs. Schauerman asked about action sheet 12, for vehicle maintenance and why it is all zeros.
Mr. Bonus stated there was no amount for that item.
Mrs. Schauerman asked if it could be pulled, and Mr. Bonus affirmed.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 13 to decrease travel by \$500 and non-bargaining wages by \$38,370.36 for Director of Administration, seconded by Scutella and passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 14, a decrease on travel and non-bargaining wages, seconded by Scutella.
Mr. Bonus stated that the action sheet 14 and action sheet 13 as well, reflected a bonus for a position that had been a concern.
Mr. Horton emphasized there were no bonuses in any other position in the County, and they did not do bonuses.
Mr. Bonus affirmed that was the agreement when action sheet 14 was discussed.
Roll call vote for action sheet 14, passed 7-0. (later rescinded)

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 15 to decrease non-bargaining wages by \$34,772.40 for Director of Administration, seconded by Spagel.
Mr. Bonus stated that action sheet 15 was eliminated by default due to the previous vote.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 17 to decrease travel work required by \$1,000 for IT, seconded by Scutella, and passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 18 a decrease of other office supplies by \$5,000 for Common Pleas Court, seconded by Scutella and passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 19 to decrease travel work required by \$500 for Safety and Training, seconded by Scutella and passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 20 to decrease travel work required by \$3,749 for the Coroner, seconded by Winarski and passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 21 to increase temporary staff by \$5,000 and decrease travel work required by \$500 for the Public Defender, seconded by Scutella and passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 22 to decrease both fees and services and travel by \$12,000 for Veteran Services, seconded by Scutella and passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 23 to increase item Sisters of St. Joseph by \$25,000 and decrease by \$44,700 in total for Grants to other Organizations, seconded by Scutella and passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 24 to increase \$30,000 for Cooperative Extensions, seconded by Scutella and passed 7-0.

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 72 to decrease \$68,427 for HR, to which eliminated a position, seconded by Scutella. Mrs. Schauerman inquired about the position and if it was still in litigation.

Mr. Bonus stated action sheet 73 would reflect an IT position to be eliminated.

Mr. Talarico noted that these two sheets that reflect positions should be rescinded until there was a ruling because there needed to be a result if the positions created were within the confines of the law.

Mr. Smith clarified that the positions were filled by employees.

Mr. Horton contributed to the discussion and stated the positions were never approved by Council.

Mr. Talarico affirmed that the County Council did not approve the positions and there was no approved funding for the positions.

Mrs. Schauerman questioned if the Council should wait for a ruling from the judge.

Mr. Horton contributed to the discussion and stated that the Council needed to do something, as it was appropriate.

Mr. Talarico stated that the people would need to be moved out of the positions.

Roll call vote for action sheet 72 passed 4-3 (Bayle, Schauerman, Shank).

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept action sheet 73, eliminate a new IT specialist II position, and decrease by \$64,101 for IT department, seconded by Scutella and passed 4-3 (Bayle, Schauerman, Shank).

A motion was made by Schauerman to accept Ordinance 114, 2023, as amended, with all the action sheets, seconded by Bayle, and passed 7-0.

Mr. Bonus provided the figure \$133,861,069.20 as being the amended amount.

There was open discussion among Council members, Mr. Bonus, and Mr. Lichtenwalter.

A motion was made by Scutella to go into recess at 7:42pm, and at 8:28pm Council returned from the recess.

Ms. Moore stated that action sheets needed adjusted, and Mr. Bonus agreed that a review was necessary.

Mr. Bonus stated action sheet 13 was good; action sheet 14 needed to be rescinded.

Ms. Moore announced a motion was needed to amend the General Fund budget and to rescind action sheet 14 and add action sheet 15.

Ms. Chillcott and Mr. Bonus both agreed.

Mr. Horton asked for clarification, which was provided by Mr. Bonus.

Mr. Bonus gave a recap that action sheets were to eliminate the bonus to the positions, but to amend will provide the proper wage increase but no bonus.

A motion was made by Horton to rescind action sheet 14 and add action 15, seconded by Mr. Spagel.

Mr. Lichtenwalter interrupted that action sheet 16 was what needed to be addressed.

Ms. Chillcott stated that it had all been worked out.

Mr. Horton stated 13 should be kept, 14 removed, and 15 added.

Mr. Lichtenwalter again reiterated his previous statement.

Mr. Horton asked that Megan and Karen clarify what sheets needed to be adjusted. Ms. Moore read action sheet 15, and stated that it had the wrong department title, it needed to be Operations, and was for the bonus for that position; action sheet 13 was for the position in the Administration that had a bonus. Mr. Bonus stated that Ms. Moore was correct.

Mr. Horton motioned to rescind sheet 14, and amend sheet 15, and stated action 16 was void, and was seconded by Spagel. Mr. Lichtenwalter interrupted and contradicted Mr. Horton. He stated action sheet 16 was good, and Mr. Horton reiterated that action sheet 16 was completely gone. Mr. Spagel stated there was a motion on the table. Mr. Lichtenwalter again interrupted. Mr. Horton stated he would like to hear from Mr. Bonus and Council staff. Mr. Lichtenwalter apologized. Ms. Chillcott stated that action sheet 14 related to the bonus and the body wanted no bonuses and so there would be no action sheet 14. Action sheet 15 was for another position and action sheet 16 reflected the bonus for the position in a different department. Mr. Horton stated the motion again that was seconded by Spagel to rescind action sheet 14, and amend action sheet 15. Ms. Chillcott, stated that because action sheet 13 was approved it did in fact void action sheet 16. Mr. Bonus stated to keep action sheet 13, rescind action sheet 14, keep 15 and throw out action sheet 16.

Mr. Horton, Mr. Shank, and Ms. Moore all agreed that action sheet 16 was void. Ms. Moore also stated that there were no duplicates. Action sheet 15 was mislabeled and was to reflect Operations and not Administration. Mr. Shank asked if everyone was clear on the motion presented by Mr. Horton. Roll call vote on action sheet 14 to be rescinded and accept action sheet 15, passed 7-0.

Mr. Horton motioned to accept amended action sheet 15, seconded by Mr. Spagel.

Mrs. Schauerman asked for clarification about correcting a mistake on the action sheet 15. Mr. Horton stated he believed that it was a bonus and a mistake on the dollar amount.

Mr. Horton stated that the title needed to be changed to Operations. Ms. Moore provided figures from the budget on the position and Mrs. Schauerman agreed that it had been discussed and Ms. Moore was correct.

Roll call vote to accept amended action sheet 15 was passed 7-0.

Ms. Moore stated that Ordinance 114, 2023, as amended, now needed to be accepted with a vote.

Mrs. Schauerman motions to accept Ordinance 114, 2023 as amended (second time), seconded by Mr. Spagel.

Ms. Chillcott asked for the new amount from Mr. Bonus. He stated the new figure is \$133,086,430.12 as amended with action sheets.

Roll call vote for Ordinance 114, as amended, passed 7-0.

Mr. Bonus stated he had calculated the total with all the reductions during the meeting, which impacted the General Fund by \$1,655,635.99. Additionally, \$2,000,000 came from the Gaming Fund that did not have any impact on the General Fund. Therefore, when discussing the tax

levy Council should consider that \$1,655,635.99 as well. He stated while working with Paul, they came up with an 8.5 mil increase. Mr. Horton noted that a \$75 increase per house was an impact. \$12,370,923 was the proposed increase, and after that night, it brought the increase down to \$10,950,000, which meant \$1,420,000 in real state tax.

Mr. Spagel contributed to the discussion, again indiscernible.

Mr. Bonus stated that .01 decrease by \$146,000.

Mr. Winarski asked how much of the General Fund would be used with .75, which is \$234,000.

Mr. Spagel contributed to the discussion, and asked how to have a 0% tax increase, and became inaudible.

Mr. Winarski asked Mr. Bonus if there were \$4,000,000 taken from the General Fund, what the tax increase would be; Mr. Bonus responded that it would remove .275 off of the .75.

Mrs. Schauerman asked if it would to be made up next year.

Mr. Bonus stated that this would be a short fall, year after year, and it was not sustainable. He stated it was expected that expenses go up each year and next year taxes would have to be raised.

Mr. Horton contributed to the discussion but was inaudible.

Mr. Bonus stated council could take an action to reduce the rate by supplementing from the General Fund, but it may not be advisable because matching revenue to expenses was desirable and was not happening right now. Mr. Horton noted that retirements would need to be reviewed.

Mr. Winarski noted that not raising the tax would affect the revenue.

Mr. Shank suggested that the meeting adjourn and could return tomorrow, if that was an option.

Mrs. Schauerman stated she would rather finish.

Mr. Horton asked how close the budget was to finalization at this point and how comfortable Mr. Bonus was with the figures.

Mr. Bonus responded that the .75 tax increase would reflect a break-even budget, but he would like to know how low the council wanted to see the tax.

Mr. Winarski and Mr. Spagel both stated .60.

Mr. Bonus stated it would need about \$4 million from the General Fund.

Mr. Horton stated that was the amount that was used out last year and it could not be done every year.

Mr. Spagel contributed that it could happen if the positions were not filled. Mr. Horton noted that then if the positions were filled; there would be a balloon effect.

Mr. Horton noted he did not want to come back to continue this meeting.

Mr. Shank stated he liked the .60 number.
Mr. Bonus noted it would cost the tax payer \$150 in taxes.
Mr. Bayle contributed to the discussion but was inaudible.
Council members began speaking over one another and could not be understood.

Mr. Winarski questioned Mr. Bonus for confirmation with \$3.9 million from the General Fund they would approve a .60 tax increase.
Mr. Bonus affirmed that was correct.
Mrs. Schauermaier noted that she felt this was just kicking the can down the road and would cause the same problem for next year.
Mr. Horton contributed to the discussion but was inaudible.
Mr. Bonus mentioned that ARPA was not going to be available in 2026 and that it could not be used in future figures.

A motion was made by Schauermaier to accept .75 for the tax increase, seconded by Mr. Bayle, failed 2-5 (Schauermaier, Bayle)

A motion was made by Winarski to accept .60 for the tax increase, seconded by Spigel.
Mr. Bonus noted that the amount from the General Fund would then need to be \$3.9 million.
Roll call vote to accept .60 of a tax increase failed 3-4 (Bayle, Spigel, and Winarski)

Mrs. Schauermaier asked Mr. Bonus to provide figures to help them find the next amount to consider for the tax increase to motion.
Mr. Shank suggests that they find a middle number between .75 and .60.
Mr. Bonus noted that if the amount was brought to a .65 tax increase and would reflect \$1.46 million.

A motion was made by Spigel to accept .65 for the tax increase, seconded by Winarski and passed 4-3 (Horton, Shank, Scutella)

Mrs. Schauermaier asked if the General Fund budget needed adjusted. Mr. Horton stated that the face sheet might need changed.

Mrs. Schauermaier motioned to amend the General Fund budget, seconded by Mr. Horton.
Mr. Horton asked for the general fund balance.
Mr. Bonus responded but was indiscernible. Mr. Horton contributed to the discussion but was able inaudible.
Roll call vote for General Fund, as amended, with the figure of \$134,546,430.12, passed 7-0.

Ordinance Number 115, 2023 “2024 Real Estate Tax Levy” (First Read 10/31/23) (Finance Committee)

Ms. Chillcott gave a Second Reading of Ordinance Number 115, 2023 "2024 Real Estate Tax Levy".

Mr. Bonus and Ms. Moore both contributed to the discussion on the exact numbers for the amendment to Ordinance 115, 2023.

Ms. Chillcott clarified that the vote to amend Ordinance 115, 2023 had been made and was .65.

Ms. Chillcott read the tax rate was hereby levied at the rate of 6.61 million on each dollar assessed value or at the rate of \$.661 on each one hundred dollars of assessed value thereof and should be adopted immediately on the date of January 1, 2024.

A motion was made by Schauerman, seconded by Spagel, and passed 7-0.

Adjournment

Chairman Shank made closing remarks prior to the motion for adjournment. He thanked everyone for coming to the meeting and, thanked the staff, he expressed gratitude to Karen and Megan. He expressed gratitude to the sheriffs who were present.

Mr. Horton also expressed his gratitude to his colleagues and the staff. He noted he did not take it lightly that he missed many meetings in the last month, and it was the first time he had missed meetings in the last 10 years and was sincerely thankful for everyone's hard work.

Mr. Horton made a motion to adjourn at 9:25pm.

***The next Finance/Personnel Committee Meetings are Thursday, December 7, 2023 at 4pm in room 114A, Erie County Courthouse or via Zoom.**

***The next Regular Meeting of County Council is Tuesday, December 12, 2023 at 6pm in room 117, Erie County Courthouse or streamed live at the link provided on the County website.**

***Members of the public wishing to speak at an upcoming Regular Meeting of Council or those requiring specific accommodation are encouraged to call or email the Council Office at (814) 451-6303 or Councilrequests@eriecountypa.gov, no later than the end of business 5 days prior to the meeting. The public must be present at the meeting to speak.**

